

## ANALYSIS OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ELECTRONIC TRAFFIC LAW ENFORCEMENT (ETLE) IN THE CITY OF PEKANBARU

Zahra Aulia Putri<sup>1</sup>.

<sup>1</sup> State Administration Study Program, Sultan Syarif Kasim State Islamic University Riau

Corresponding Author Email: [zahramtsmuda@gmail.com](mailto:zahramtsmuda@gmail.com)

### ABSTRACT

**Received: 08-06-2024**  
**Accepted: 27-11-2024**

#### Keywords:

*Implementation, Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE), Violations*

The formation of ETLE is a technological development carried out from manual (Conventional) tickets to electronic tickets (ETLE) to prevent traffic accidents and accidents. This study aims to find an analysis of the implementation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) in the city of Pekanbaru and what are the obstacles to the implementation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) in the city of Pekanbaru. This research method uses a qualitative descriptive method with the collection of interviews, observations, and documentation data. This research uses Edward's theory with the indicators used, namely: Communication, Resources, Disposition, and Bureaucratic Structure. The results of this study show that the implementation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) in the city of Pekanbaru has been carried out well and as it should, but there are several obstacles such as less optimal communication between the police and the community regarding ETLE, limited ETLE facilities in arresting traffic violators, and cultural factors of the community who are afraid of being violated if there is a police guard.

### 1. INTRODUCTION

One of the stages of change in launching and ordering a good public service system is to carry out improvement movements for all renewal and modernization of existing service lines, for example in the field of order and security. One of the services is law enforcement officials, namely the Indonesian National Police. One of the functions of the police as recorded in Law No. 2 of 2002 Article 13 concerning the National Police of the Republic of Indonesia is to maintain public security and order, enforce the law, and provide protection, protection, and service to the community.

With that, it is hoped that there will be justice in the community regarding the law in Indonesia in terms of security, law, protection, and service. The number of traffic violations in Indonesia is very high, especially in the big city of Pekanbaru. There are always violations on the highway causing traffic jams and accidents. For people who commit violations, they will be dealt with legally and will be subject to sanctions or fines. This aims to provide a deterrent effect to road users who violate the rules by traffic laws and regulations (Setiyanto, Gunarto, & Wahyuningsih, 2017). To minimize the occurrence of an accident or traffic violation, the government and also the police then initiated a policy related to the renewal of the ticketing system. This is because the ticketing system used so far is still conventional or manual. The government makes an innovation that takes advantage of advances in Technology and Information and thinks to study and form a new system or policy related to the existing ticketing system by implementing a new and more advanced ticketing system, namely electronic ticketing, or known as E-Tilang in Indonesia. E-Tilang is a

process of fines carried out by the police to traffic violators that is different from fines in general which still have to be recorded manually on a blank piece of paper or ticket (Arifin, et al. 2020).

After the renewal of Electronic Tickets (E-Tilang), namely the payment of Tickets through Digital, the Indonesian National Police tried to create innovations with the implementation of the Electronic Ticket Implementation Program better known as ETLE (Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement) is one of the developments of e-government. The birth of this policy can be said to be due to the many problems that occur such as extortion, peace in place, the problem of court ticket hearings to the accountability of fines. Even though the ticket is one of the state revenues, not PNPB tax. With this new policy on Electronic Tickets, people as traffic users in their daily lives will pay attention to driving, be careful in driving, and ensure that all traffic equipment is fulfilled so that there are no accidents in driving and that the desired bureaucratic system can run well. The ETLE policy aims to improve the security, order, and smoothness of road users and to avoid police officers with the community or violators so that an optimum does not perform his duties by SOPs and the occurrence of extortion.

With the existence of the Standard Operational Procedures, the government is more transparent regarding service procedures, administrative requirements, details of costs, and completion times so that it does not cause the service process to be complicated and indicate the existence of corrupt practices. And as a guideline regarding the duties and authorities that will be handed over to certain officers who will handle one specific service process. The ETLE Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) applied to the Riau Police are based on Law Number 22

of 2009 concerning LLAJ and Government Regulation Number 80 of 2012 concerning Procedures for Inspection of Motor Vehicles on the Road and Dakgar Lantas. In Article 272 paragraph (1) of the LLAJ Law "To support activities to enforce violations in the field of Traffic and Road Transportation, electronic equipment can be used."

In the development of increasingly advanced technology and to avoid violations in the refining process, throughout Indonesia and especially Pekanbaru itself, the implementation of ETLE began on March 23, 2021, and there are 4 ETLE CCTV Points, including on Jalan HR Subrantas (Simpang Tabek Gadang), Jalan Tuanku Tambusai (in front of Mall Living World), Jalan Sudirman (in front of Mapolda Riau Lama). And on Jalan Imam Munandar (in front of the Alpha Hotel).

Table I.I  
Traffic Violators at 4 CCTV ETLE Points

It	ETLE CCTV Point	2021	2022	2023
1.	HR Subrantas Road	169.964	217.988	128.527
2.	Jalan Tuanku Tambusai	143.849	164.760	75.393
3.	Jalan Sudirman	21.172	36.317	27.037
4.	Jalan Imam Munandar	187.095	213.034	109.206

Source: Riau Regional Police Directorate in 2023

Based on the table above, explains the number of traffic violators through 4 ETLE CCTV camera points in the city of Pekanbaru. At the location of the ETLE camera point, there are the most violators on the HR road. Subrantas Panam, which is already known to the HR Region. Subrantas is the most populous population in the city of Pekanbaru. This has resulted in a large number of traffic violators that occur there.

Types of Violations and Sanctions in ETLE:

1. Breaking through traffic light 287 paragraph (1) 2 months imprisonment or a maximum fine of IDR 500 thousand.
2. Using a cell phone while driving 283 is imprisonment for a maximum of 3 months or a maximum fine of IDR 750 thousand.
3. Not wearing a seat belt 106 paragraph (6) imprisonment for 1 month or a maximum fine of IDR 250 thousand.
4. Not wearing an SNI helmet article 106 paragraph (8) imprisonment for a maximum of 1 month or a maximum fine of Rp 250 thousand.

From the number of traffic violators and the types of fines above, it can be seen that many traffic violators are still committed by the community in the city of Pekanbaru. With the enactment of ETLE and ETLE fines, the Police at the Riau Police arrested many traffic violators as shown in the table

below.

Table I.2  
The number of traffic sign violators affected by Electronic Tickets (E-Tilang) who use 4 Wheels in the city of Pekanbaru.

Number of E-Ticket Violations R.4					
NO	Types of Violations	Year			Sum
		2020	2021	2022	
1	Speed	-	-	-	-
2	Charge	569	52	100	1210
3	Completeness	346	70	109	984
4	Seat Belt	1.469	740	1.166	6019
5	Sign Marks	2.095	1.213	1.602	8297
6	Going Against the Flow	918	120	14	1383
7	Using a cellphone	166	53	34	588

Source: Riau Regional Police Directorate in 2023

It can be seen in the table above that the number of traffic violators from 2019 to 2021 has decreased, this has a positive impact on the Pekanbaru Police because it makes their duties easier and no longer requires manual tickets. But in 2022 it has increased, because many people feel that they have never been ticketed and the ticket letter is also not there at their homes it can also be seen that many ETLE cameras are dead, dead ETLE can be seen on Jalan HR Soebrantas, the intersection of SKA and the Harapan Raya flyover. According to online news on September 5, 2023, by the Riau Police Traffic <https://www.detik.com/Direktur>, Kombes Dwi Nur Setiawan confirmed that ETLE in Pekanbaru City was dead. It was recorded that there were four ETLE deaths, namely:

"That's right, there are four ETLE deaths. Died because it was in the process of treatment." (<https://www.detik.com/sumut/berita/d-6913908/kamera-etle-di-pekanbaru-mati-ini-kata-polda-riau>. Accessed October 31, 2023)

Table I.3  
The number of data on traffic sign violators who are affected by electronic tickets (e-tickets) using 2 wheels in the city of Pekanbaru.

Number of E-Ticket Violations R.2					
It	Types of Violations	Year			Sum
		2020	2021	2022	
1	Helmet	5.863	2.770	4.176	20.988
2	Speed	103	117	73	535
3	Over +1	3	-	1	9
4	Sign Marks	4.026	1.829	4.326	15.942
5	Going Against the Flow	3.042	306	43	5.524
6	Using a cellphone	64	10	20	169

Source: Riau Regional Police Directorate in 2023

From the table above we can see that there are still many traffic violations that occurred in the new week, in the table above we can also see that there are more 2-wheel traffic violators than 4-wheelers. With the enactment of ETLE, there has been a decrease in violations that occurred from 2019 to 2021, this can be seen in the table above. It is hoped that in 2022 there will be

an increase, with the installation of ETLE, it is hoped that the recording of traffic violations will be more optimal and make the public aware of the rules that have been implemented.

Regarding the issues that exist in the implementation of the ETLE SOP, several problems occur that result in the disruption of the implementation of the SOP which results in the suboptimal implementation of the ETLE. That way, the police are still implementing manual ticketing activities so that the use of ETLE is more optimal, such as online news in the following [https://riau.antaraneews.com/ media](https://riau.antaraneews.com/media):

"The Pekanbaru Police Satlantas optimizes the use of ETLE Mobile for the smooth implementation of the 2023 yellow presumptuous zebra operation by combing locations or roads that are not reached by static ETLE. The violations that were found were visible violations such as not using a helmet. Operation Zebra Lancang Kuning 2023 Pekanbaru Police has cracked down on as many as 1,122 traffic violations". (Firdausi, A. (2023, September 11). Pekanbaru Police optimize mobile ETLE during Operation Zebra Lancang Kuning 2023. Accessed dari <https://riau.antaraneews.com/berita/345996/polisi-pekanbaru-optimalkan-etle-mobile-selama-operasi-zebra-lancang-kuning-2023>)

Manual tickets are still carried out because of the lack of optimal ETLE, this can be seen because ETLE cannot catch violators who turn the current, contact people who do not comply with standards and those who do not bring a driver's license and vehicle registration. In the implementation of ETLE, there are still many violators who do not comply with traffic rules even though ETLE has been installed.

Based on the phenomena and problems that occurred above, the author is interested in conducting research with the title "Analysis of the Implementation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) in the City of Pekanbaru".

## 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

### Public Policy

Policy is a collection of decisions taken by an actor or political group, to choose goals and ways to achieve certain goals. Broadly speaking, public policy as a process consists of activities to formulate, implement, and evaluate the results and impacts of policies. Mustopodidjaja in Rakhmat (2009: 132) It is said that public policy is a decision to overcome certain problems to achieve certain goals, which is carried out by authorized agencies in the context of implementing state government and development tasks. In the life of public administration, formally the decision is outlined in various forms of legislation.

Smith and Larimer (2009:3) in their book entitled "The Public Theory Primer" put forward various opinions about policy. Policy is whatever governments choose to do or not to do. Anything that is done or not done by the government in the public interest or society is part of public policy. In short, public policy can be interpreted as actions taken by the government or activities carried out by the government. Public policy is all actions that the government wants and is in line with the goals to be achieved through government programs. This means that state policies also include policy formulation, policy implementation, and policy evaluation which are then reformulated. Therefore, the approach that is generally used is the systems approach, which seeks to explain the integration between the environment, the political system, and state policies.

James E. Anderson (2008:18) in Budi Winarno, Public

policies are policies developed by government agencies and officials. According to Abdul Wahab (2005), public policy is a sanctioned action that leads to a specific goal that is directed at a certain interrelated problem that affects most of the citizens. Public policies are the regulations of a country so that the activities carried out are by the rules that have been set and have limits in carrying out their goals. Whatever the case, the public policy set has a great influence on the community. This is emphasized by Udoji (quoted Wahab, 1997: 5) who formulates public policy as a sanctioned action that leads to a specific goal directed at a specific problem or a group of problems that are interrelated and affect most citizens of society. The same thing is affirmed by Hoogerwerf (in Sunggono, 1994: 12) who states that the important objectives of public policy in general are:

1. maintaining public order;
2. advancing the development of society in various ways;
3. combining various activities;
4. Pointing and dividing various material and nonmaterial objects.

The policy concept offered by Anderson according to Budi Winarno (2007: 18) is considered more appropriate because it focuses on what is done and not on what is proposed or intended. In addition, this concept also clearly distinguishes between policy and decision which means choosing among the various alternatives that exist.

Policy implementation is a fairly important stage in public policy. Broadly, implementation is often thought of as a form of law enforcement in which various actors, organizations, and technicals work together to implement policies to achieve policy or program goals. Leo Agustino (2008:70) said that implementation is a dynamic process, where in the implementation of a policy an activity is carried out so that in the end it will get a result that is by the goals or objectives of the policy itself. Policy implementation, when viewed in a broad sense, is a tool of legal administration where various actors, organizations, procedures, and techniques work together to implement policies to achieve the desired impact or goals.

Based on the statement of George C. Edwards III about policy implementation, it can be said that policy implementation is the policy-making stage between the formation of policies such as part of legislative actions, issuing executive orders, handing down judicial decisions, or issuing regulations and the consequences of policies for the people who influence.

### Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE)

The implementation of electronic ticketing better known as ETLE (Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement) is one of the developments of e-government. The birth of this policy can be said to be due to the many problems that occur such as extortion, peace in place, the problem of court tickets to the accountability of fines. The ETLE policy aims to improve the security, order, and smoothness of road users and to avoid police officers with the community or violators so that an optimum does not perform his duties by SOPs and the occurrence of extortion. ETLE is a smart camera technology that can capture violations that occur, so E-Tilang is a system owned by every police officer to

prevent the practice of extortion by making it easier to pay tickets.

Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement is the implementation of information technology to catch violations in traffic electronically to support security, order, safety, and order in traffic. ETLE is an implementation of a new ticketing system due to developments in the field of technology that is useful for capturing all forms of violations on the road with electronic media in the form of digital tools, namely cameras to support public order and safety in traffic (Saputra, 2021, p. 2).

According to Sandy Subavhe (2017: 43) Electronic Ticketing (E-Ticket) is a ticketing system applied to traffic sign violators who use Electronic Ticketing devices which is a process of digitizing the ticketing process, by utilizing technology it is hoped that the entire ticketing process will be more efficient and also effective in helping the police and administrative management. Electronic ticketing is a form of information technology implementation carried out by the Indonesian National Police to crack down on traffic violations electronically to support security, order, and safety while driving. Proof of Violation abbreviated as Ticket is a fine imposed by the Police on road users who violate the rules. Road users often violate the rules that have been set by traffic laws. The ticket is expected to be able to handle traffic problems.

E-Tilang or Electronic Ticket is a digitization of the ticketing process, by utilizing technology, it is hoped that the entire ticketing process will be more efficient and also effective in helping the police in administrative management. The application is categorized into two users, the first is the police and the second is the prosecutor's office. On the police side, the system will run on a tablet computer with the Android operating system while on the prosecutor's side, the system will run in the form of a website, as an executor like a manual trial process.

This e-ticket appears with the following legal basis:

- a. Number 8 of 1981 concerning the Criminal Code.
- b. Law number 22 of 2009 concerning traffic and road transportation.
- c. Law number 11 of 2008 concerning information and electronic transactions, government regulation number 80 of 2012 concerning procedures for inspecting motor vehicles on highways, and enforcement of traffic and road transportation violations.
- d. The National Police Chief's order number: spring/1376/VII/2016 dated July 1, 2016, concerning the National Police Chief's priority program activist team.
- e. Telegram letter of the National Police Chief number: st/2581/X/2016 dated October 22, 2016, concerning training in the application of the online ticketing system.

- f. Perma number 12 of 2016 concerning procedures for resolving traffic violation cases.

The enforcement of electronic tickets is applied to all types of vehicles in 34 provinces. There are two applicable electronic ticketing systems, namely static and mobile electronic tickets. The static electronic ticketing system utilizes surveillance cameras at several points managed by officers at the National Police Traffic Management Center to record traffic violations. Meanwhile, the mobile electronic ticketing system is a violation enforcement by utilizing surveillance cameras installed in police vehicles or using smartphones. Enforcement can only be carried out by police officers who have been equipped with a letter of assignment to use a smartphone camera and have their official IME number recorded. The mobile electronic ticketing system is used to crack down on drivers who do not wear helmets, go against the flow, park in place, and other traffic violations that cannot be reached by static electronic ticketing systems. Surveillance cameras can record the driver's face, vehicle policy number, and the physical shape of the vehicle as a whole. The officer will later send a notification letter to the traffic violator to confirm the violation. If the violator does not confirm after the notification letter is given, then the violator's vehicle papers will be blocked. As a result, violators cannot make tax payments.

ETLE provides a more transparent, effective mechanism or flow of fines and avoids illegal levies. The reason is, that when a motorist commits a violation caught by an ETLE camera, the arrest will then be identified by police officers. Then, after identifying the vehicle data and the type of violation, a ticket will be sent to the address of the vehicle owner.

---

### 3. METHODS

The type of research conducted by the author is a type of qualitative descriptive research. Qualitative descriptive research is one of the types of research that is included in the type of qualitative research. Descriptive research is a research strategy in which the researcher investigates events, and phenomena in the lives of individuals and asks a person or group of individuals to tell their lives. This information is then retold by the researcher in a descriptive chronology.

This research was carried out by the Riau Regional Police Task Force, the Pekanbaru Police Task Force, and ETLE installation sites. This study uses purposive sampling because the informants taken have the necessary information about the implementation of ETLE. This research uses data collection techniques using interviews, observations, and documentation.

### 4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

#### Communication

According to Edward III (Muhammad Sawir, 2021: 172-177), communication is the success of policy implementation, requiring implementers to know what to do, and where the goals and objectives of the policy must be conveyed to the target group.

Based on the results of the interview with the Police, it was explained that communication about the implementation of ETLE had been carried out well with the direction of the National Police Chief and carried out by the Riau Police Chief either directly or indirectly, namely since the beginning of the Grand Launching, socialization, through the media and banners. Communication is a very important start because it is a successful policy implementation. The following is a documentation of the form of socialization of the implementation of ETLE in Pekanbaru City:

#### Resources

According to Edward III (Muhammad Sawir, 2021: 172-177), Resources are effective support for an activity to be carried out, this can be seen from its human resources. If the implementer lacks the resources to implement, then the implementation will not be effective.

Based on the results of interviews with the police, the researcher concluded that ETLE facilities starting from facilities and infrastructure are good. The equipment for the implementation of ETLE is also increasing from year to year by technological advances such as the existence of ETLE Mobile Handheld and ETLE Mobile Onboard which are carried out directly by officers in the field.

#### Disposition

According to Edward III, a disposition is the disposition and characteristics possessed by the implementer, such as commitment, honesty, and democratic nature. If the implementer has a good disposition, then the implementer can implement the policy well as desired by the policymaker. When the implementer has a different attitude or perspective from the policymaker, the policy implementation process also becomes ineffective.

Disposition is the attitude of the implementers that will cause real obstacles to the implementation of policies if existing personnel do not implement the desired policies.

Based on the results of the researcher's interviews with the public, it can be concluded that with these technological advances, the public believes that the existence of ETLE can avoid misunderstandings between the public and the police regarding ticket sanctions. And also the occurrence of clear transparency when committing traffic violations.

#### Bureaucratic Structure

A bureaucratic Structure is an organizational structure that is tasked with implementing policies that have a significant influence on policy implementation. Aspects of the organizational structure are Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) and fragmentation. An organizational structure that is too long will tend to weaken supervision and cause red tape, which is a complicated and complex bureaucratic procedure, which makes organizational activities inflexible.

Based on the results of the interview with the police, the researcher explained that the regulations regarding the ETLE SOP have been regulated in police regulations based on Law Number 22 of 2009 concerning LLAJ and Government Regulation Number 80 of 2012 concerning Procedures for Checking Motor Vehicles on the Road and Dakgar Lantas. In Article 272 paragraph (1) of the LLAJ Law "To support activities to enforce violations in the field of Traffic and Road Transportation, electronic equipment can be used."

The following are the results of the researcher's interview with the community, it can be concluded that the development of ETLE technology, makes work more practical and by work procedures, but does not necessarily make work easier, this happens because implementation is easier to do if there are direct workers who take part in the field.

### CONCLUSION

The implementation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement in the city of Pekanbaru can be said to have been running properly. The delivery of communication between the police and the community is carried out well but not optimally, from socialization and Social Media. The officers also carry out their responsibilities by their positions and applicable SOPs, ETLE technology has also developed from time to time starting from Static ETLE and there have been changes, namely ETLE Mobile Handheld and ETLE Mobile Onboard used in Patrol cars. Where the ETLE mechanism itself is already on the official website of the National Police, namely <https://etle-korlantas.info/> and the ticket sanction system can also be accessed through the <https://etilang.polri.go.id/> website.

The obstacles in the implementation of the Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement Against Traffic Sign Violators in Pekanbaru City are

#### a. Communication factors

There is still no optimal communication between the police and the community, this happens because it is not necessarily the people who have Android and the delivery of communication carried out by the police is also direct and indirect there has been no significant update regarding ETLE. Many people also consider ETLE not as a sanction to be imposed and seem to ignore the existence of ETLE.

#### b. Facility Factor

There are still limited ETLE facilities and infrastructure, many traffic violators are not arrested by ETLE, one

example is such as riding on a 3-wheeler and using a fake contact pot, this certainly makes it difficult for the police, therefore manual (Conventional) tickets are still being implemented to make the implementation of ETLE more effective and efficient. The community perceives the lack of justice for the users of loan vehicles who are ticketed are those who own the vehicle, therefore there is still a feeling that the community feels disadvantaged because they feel that they do not violate ETLE. It takes time and a large budget fund for changes to be made.

c. Community Cultural Factors

There are still many people who are not afraid of electronic tickets (ETLE) and if manual tickets (Conventional) are carried out, they will obey the regulations. With the existence of ETLE, it is hoped that there will be no illegal and dangerous street fights between the police and the community, but there are still many traffic violations by ETLE. With that, manual tickets are still in effect for the police to be more effective in traffic.

**REFERENCES**

**Book**

Arikunto, Suharsimi. (2010). *Research Procedure: A Practical Approach*. PT Rineka Cipta: Jakarta.

Budi Winarno, *Public Policy in the Era of Globalization*, p. 134.

Leo Agustino, *Fundamentals of Public Policy*, (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2008), p. 70.

Miriam Budiardjo. (2013). *Fundamentals of Political Science*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama. p. 20.

Ramdlon Naning, 1983, *Stimulating Public Legal Awareness and Law Enforcement Discipline in Traffic*, Surabaya, Bina Ilmu, p. 57

Santosa, *Dwi Joko*. (2014). *Better understanding of SOP (Standard Operating Procedure)*. Surabaya: Said Pena.

Sugiyono. (2018). *Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed methods of research*. Bandung: Alfabeta

Sulistyarini, Ria Indah. Novianti, Nur Pratiwi (2012). *Interview: An Effective Method for Understanding Human Behavior*. CV. Karya Putra Darwati: Bandung.

Usman, Husaini. Setiady, Purnomo. (2008). *Social Research Methodology*. PT Bumi Aksara: Jakarta.

Wibowo. (2013). *Organizational Culture*. Rajawali Press: Jakarta

**Journal**

Armala, Yuli & M. Yasir. (2022). *Implementation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) in the jurisdiction of the Bojonegoro Resort Police*. Law Journal. Faculty of Law, Bojonegoro University.

Arifin, Koko Prasetyo, et al. (2020) "The Level of Public Awareness of the Implementation of the E-ticketing System in Surabaya City" *Student Journal of Public Management* 2020 p.4.

Charles Rio Valentine Pardede, et al. (2022). *Analysis of the Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) Program in the Context of Creating Kamseltibcarlantas (Case Study of Serang City)*. Journal of Innovation Research and Knowledge. 533-542.

Putri, Septika Ayu, & Zaili, Rusli. (2022). *Implementation of the Socialization of the Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) Program as an Effort to Realize a Culture of Traffic Order in the City of Pekanbaru*. <https://journal.iainsambas.ac.id/>, 1349-1356.

Setiyanto, Gunarto, & Wahyuningsih, S. endah. (2017). *The Effectiveness of the Implementation of E-Ticket Fine Sanctions for Traffic Violators Based on Law Number 22 of 2009 concerning Traffic and Road Transportation (Study at the Rembang Police)*. *Khaira Ummah Law Journal*, 12(4), 754–766.

Syafitri, Endah, & Dadang, Mashur. (2022). *The Effectiveness of the Implementation of the National Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) Program in Improving Public Services in the City of Pekanbaru*. <https://journal.iainsambas.ac.id/1322-1337>.

**Thesis**

Angeline Annabella Siahaan. (2022). *Implementation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) Point H.R.Soebrantas for Traffic Violators of Mobile Phone Users by 4-Wheeled Vehicles in the Jurisdiction of the Riau Police*. Riau Islamic University.

Eka Prima. (2018). *Implementation of Online Ticket Regulations or E-Tilang by the Traffic Unit (Satlantas) of the Pekanbaru Police*. Sultan Syarif Kasim State Islamic University, Riau.

Joko Setiawan. (2022). *Implementation of Electronic Traffic Law Enforcement (ETLE) Policy in Bandar Lampung City (Case Study on Bandar Lampung City Police)*. University of Lampung.

Salsadila Juwita. (2023). *Implementation of the Electronic Ticket Policy (E-Tilang) for Traffic Violations in the Jurisdiction of the Pekanbaru Police*. Sultan Syarif Kasim State Islamic University, Riau.